

**WEST HAWAII FISHERY COUNCIL**  
<http://westhawaiifisherycouncil.org>  
[WHFC@hawaii.rr.com](mailto:WHFC@hawaii.rr.com)

*MISSION STATEMENT OF THE WEST HAWAII FISHERY COUNCIL*  
*“To effectively manage fishery activities to ensure sustainability; enhance nearshore resources; develop and implement management plans for minimizing resource depletion and conflicts of use; per legislative mandate to the Department of Land and Natural Resources to provide for substantive involvement of the community in resource management decisions; and encourage scientific research and monitoring of the nearshore resources and environment from Upolu Point to Ka Lae.”*

**Draft Minutes for Thursday, Nov. 19, 2015**  
West Hawaii Civic Center Community Hale (Building G)  
Presiding: Dale Sarver

**Call to Order:** 6:30pm called to order by Dale Sarver

Reading and Interpretation of WHFC Mission Statement

- Read by Dave Dart

Reiteration by the Chair of the meeting protocols from WHFC Policies and Operational Guidelines and posted at meeting.

\*All questions from Council members must be recognized by the Chair

\*All questions/statements will be limited to topic oriented statements. Note that a short time has been added after each agenda item to discuss that item.

\*Proxies: Each person asking someone to represent them by proxy will have to notify the administrator before the meeting as to who is going to represent them. There will be no call for proxies from the floor at the meeting.

Introductions of Visitors

- Micah Stephenson (TNC- Intern), Healani Cahill (Community Member), Bruce Anderson (DAR), Mike Nakachi (Community Member)

Members:

- Tina Owens, Dale Sarver, Linda Preskitt, Chad Wiggins, Bill Walsh, Charlie Young, JR Rosalio, Dave Dart, Donna Goodale, Malia Kipapa.

Approval of Agenda

- Chad Wiggins - Add on some items to help us prepare for strategic planning meeting next month.
- Tina Owens move to approve, Dale Sarver second; motion carried and approved.

Bruce Anderson - Short Presentation.

- Someone posed an immediate band on aquarium fish to help evaluate the situation. Chapter 343 to help protect the spread of coral bleaching.
  - o We (Bill Walsh and I) responded that aquarium fish does not promote coral bleaching; we did bring up that parrot fish can help we did not feel

- that an emergency action for this concern; this action will not be affected. West HI and Oahu has the highest rate of aquarium fish collecting.
- Issue has been litigated and court has ruled that aquarium fishing does not require an EA and now this ruling is being challenged.
  - Management measures – will form a working group to come up with practical measures that we can do here after doing research. We are looking for a staff person to help with the collection of this information. Will take about a couple of months to gather this information on bleached reef. This group will involve mostly scientists and managers from Hawaii. This effort will take about 6 months to come up with a rule and a year to come up with an implementation plan.
  - West Hawaii is ahead of addressing this type of issues and hope that you folks can help us in developing this plan.

#### Questions:

- Dave Dart – why can't a plan be put in to protect parrot fish and sea urchins just like sea cucumbers? We seldom see large fish anymore, only small. This could be a positive step.
  - Bruce Anderson – it's more like an insidious problem, I don't know if we can argue this as an emergency issue; need to remember it's only a hold for a 180 days. It's a statewide problem and other issues we should talk about first – what do want to look at first for example do you want to look at night spearing, folks and still go out at night to shoot parrot fish. I think we need to set up maybe a maximum size of parrot fish looking from a reproductive standpoint. We need to give some thought as to what will be the most effective approach. I do hear your urgency though, we need to get a practical list together first.
- Tina Owens –
  - Two things:
    - About Miss Willy's Letter – 17 environmental agencies, I think only 3 were legitimate – Dog adoption, one canoe club and snorkel Bob's website.
    - We would like to ask fisherman to please don't take the fish because we want to have them on the reef to help with reef recovery? Do you think we can do this?
      - Bruce Anderson – most fisherman don't look at their role, but if they knew how important it is to the reef I think they would make the adjustment. I think this would be something that can be done easily. I was involved with the Ulua project and changing the ethics for fisherman, catch and release some of them felt happy of what they were doing, very effective program. Thousands of fishermen participated and learned a lot from this.
- Charlie Young –
  - I represent Ho'okena and I'm part of Kupa, I was part of the ban on aquarium fish collecting, this comes from my cultural background, the fish that are being collected by collectors are food fish for us. I'm happy but

not satisfied with current settlement. I want you to take into account and involve the, community, the cultural part and fisherman factors when making decisions; yellow eye kole, pakuikui and laupala are on the list and are food fish for us, we can't figure out its large decline. Is there something we can do to help with the state budget? When we ask for help they always say they don't have enough people, more and more pressure are happening in our community in Ho'okena. We are looking for a more sustainable model for our community. If there are any issues within the budgetary process we would greatly like to support this.

- Bruce Anderson – I would like to hear back from you on some feedback on what communities think and groups that we can talk too. Maybe there are places we would like to take into consideration, what is good for one community may not be good for another, will be very important on how different measures will work or impact their communities. Better to get it more informally, working with the fishery, especially for education. We surveyed 3 areas in Kealakekua Bay but it's valuable, we are very short of resources in different areas. I think we are status quo and I came in after the budget was approved, no knew requests.
- Chad – I think coordinating the plan Petra MacGowan a really good access to help compile information on what works and doesn't work. I think if done correctly and in a respectful way it will be good, hope that you can keep the communication lines open; a recovery plan for resilience is a need now, all projection
  - Bruce Anderson – thank you I would like to know of some names; we do have a planner position that will open. Different ways on how we can move on this, I agree from a few months to a year we will need to start moving on this to make it happen.
- Dale Sarver – are you looking at pointing at this as it will last forever or just a short term deal with this just right now?
  - Bruce Anderson – I'm looking at a short term, but I'm looking to tie both in this – budgets being proposed by different groups and good research but I need to look at the immediacy of the coral reef bleaching to look at this foremost; coral reef bleaching is what will trigger rules we need to look at this not only from a political stance, bleaching will get people's attention.
  - Dale Sarver – there are some things we can address now with rules and some that we have to look at that is more long term.
  - Bruce Anderson – we need to come up with some issues that we can make a list about; example storm water runoff, channelized water; reality is this will take years to address, a really hard issue to go after. Another example spearing in Puako, if they put in a sewer it will take 5 – 10 years. I think you will end up with short term and long term actions.
  - Dale Sarver – okay so you have this pile can't do much for long time, so we need to come up with a plan to show where most of efforts will need to be focused on.
  - Bruce Anderson – we need to find a good planner to help sort out the plans for those we can do quickly and those that will take more time.

- Healani Cahill – I don't think bleaching is new; I want to ask the council, coral bleaching was an issue before. I heard a lot about the aquarium fish collections and how a lot of the fish does not make it when they are sent out.
  - Dale Sarver – I don't think too much of them die, I think people are taking information from Philippines and other areas and not here in Hawaii, it's a wired business in here. I would say look further into those numbers.
  - Tina Owens – this council was formed in 1998, so it's just coming up to be 18 years old and in those 18 years we have not seen bleaching at this extent. Bleaching has happened in a cyclical manner for thousands of years, if there hadn't been a change in temperature this wouldn't have been this bad. 1998 Indonesia had a really bad El Nino but in 4 years
  - Chad Wiggins – bleaching people think it's from actual bleach on the reef, it's an environmental impact. When the coral releases its algae spores and it loses its color and so the white is the color of the coral skeleton.
  - Mike Nakachi –I've had the privilege in the last two months and never saw bleaching this bad. This is my home and I don't have anywhere else to go. I do trust science and agree with the work you folks are doing. This is very complicated and it's a social and cultural issue, we have been at this for a long time, and want to do it right. We still don't have the right rules and enforcement in place. Commercial supersedes the public and cultural resources. Dave Dart I like him but he's taking my public trust resource and he can poke as much as he wants. I'm glad that Bill is here to share about his work. I needed to speak about this.
    - Bruce Anderson - I agree and hear your comments
  - Dave Dart - I think that we need to move into the no take areas. I see a lot of barren areas; we have a large population of Micronesians that take fish daily because they eat a lot of fish and no enforcement. We don't have the no take; we don't take the large pakuikui and laupala, we have size limits. I think this is a good opportunity to get the community involved with the no take areas; get going on this it will help everything else.
    - Charlie Young – I pick Kealia
- Bruce Anderson – right now we have DAR and DOCARE separated and this is a very difficult issue for them to address, enforcement officers are being spread thin. I think we need more enforcement
  - Charlie Young – I failed to mention that there are communities themselves can help with, there are some communities throughout the state that have taken that responsibility to take an active role in their communities to monitor sites. Even when you report things it's all about how they prioritize the request. I would certainly encourage you to look at these types of active communities that maybe can help with not only management but also enforcement
    - Bruce Anderson – I want to ask Hannah how do they expect to enforce rules and practice because I know all the people will be there all the time; I'm eager to learn more about it.

- JR Rosalio – enforcement – can you folks can a grant to get more enforcement? If you're making the rules and no enforcement why make the rule? Enforcement is important; people, vehicle before making the rule
  - o Bruce Anderson – we do give money to DOCARE to enforce the fishing rules and also hunting, and we only have so many that can go around, we need to do this more efficiently and or find more money.
  - o Bill Walsh – there was an experiment on Maui that was done to fund for enforcement for DAR.
- Donna Goodale – massive bleaching will affect the largest industry in the state you can take this to (wind at our back) the legislature that the tourist industry is very reliable on the reef.
- Bill Walsh – why make rules if you don't have any enforcement? Make good rules, to help us to enforce them!

#### Approval of Minutes

- Chad Wiggins – change verbiage from Eric's Q&A session, Eric mentioned some methods in which were used in the Caribbean and throughout different Pacific Islands that have shown to work with coral bleaching problems.
- Linda Preskitt – make the change from expel symbiosis to expel algae s
- Approve as amended by Tina and second by Donna, motion carried and minutes approved.

#### **New Business:**

- Discuss how the Council will present the Fish Reserves mandate to the public.
  - o Dale Sarver –I did not get a response.
  - o Tina Owens – establishment of these marine reserves is to help preserve and protect our coral reefs; I read a bunch of papers and most have mentioned marine reserves do you think they will be using this to promote resiliency for coral reefs.
    - Donna Goodale – you mean in General?
  - o Chad Wiggins – the state did show the response by bringing Bruce here to our last meeting and now this meeting. I think civil engagement has helped and is showing through this interest.
  - o Bill Walsh – I think the planning happening, one size doesn't fit all; a broader discussion will need to happen; review findings and asking stakeholders to map out things then you can find overlaps when consolidated and then from there you can fundamentally get the community involved. Similar process could be employed.
    - Tina Owens – I think we can go a long way, if Dr. Andersons plan does include a marine reserve we might be able sweeten the pot a little because we know we will need to have a public hearing. I think through education we need to show the value of marine reserves as an education pitch, some means of letting the people know its importance.

- Dale Sarver – do we want to get involved? We’ve always decided that this is the top priority, marine
- Chad Wiggins - I think we shouldn’t be putting out publicly that marine reserves and the mandate is our main priority.
- Healani Cahill – I remember when everyone had that map out, it has had its positive impacts and have made a difference.
- Charlie Young – do you still have the maps Bill?
  - Bill – yes I do
  - Charlie – we should get together and look it over and start looking at this.
- Linda Preskitt – sorry missed last month but are we focusing on marine reserves?
- Tina Owens – I would like to make a motion to start a subcommittee to do an educational
  - Chad Wiggins – its working with people we know and trust in communities and have them be present in these meetings even if we need to go out and meet with them.
  - Mike Nakachi – I believe that there are good things that this council does, but we need to get the communities more involved; the resource needs to be available for the public and cultural purposes.
  - Healani Cahill – comment to what Chad said, it is very important to find people in the community that are strategic. I’ve been there where people have not been included to give their mana’o. This needs to happen if we want to get everyone involved.
  - Dale Sarver – I think we should
  - Charlie Young – I looked at our last council and there were 7 of us and 4 have passed away. I think we just need to set the date and find the funding on how to get the people there and involved. I can’t remember having any Ka’u folks at our meetings.
  - Dale Sarver – we agreed that this coral bleaching we had a lot of people are looking at it and now’s the time to move. Some advantage to move quickly. Educate people of what we do, but we would lose the attention with this coral bleaching issue.
  - Chad Wiggins – I think your idea of refraining from taking herbivores from reef because of the coral bleaching is a great idea but may raise some resistance
  - Tina Owens – we should wait till DAR comes up with the plan and just discuss ideas in the meantime on how to approach this matter.
  - Donna Goodale - -coral bleaching education built into 3 different parts within 9 months.
  - Healani Cahill – ours would be based on community input,

I would think those on top would be able to hear what communities think.

- Tina Owens – for example if it's a choice between if you want one or not want one?
- Charlie Young - do we have enough information that can map out where all the bleaching is?
  - Bill – we will have some good data after our survey
- Chad Wiggins – we are in a new paradigm, dialogue needs to start, and will we be able to fish at all in the next years to come if we fish now?
  - Bill – presenting the option of not doing anything, we can give you an idea on what it will look like if you don't.
- Charlie Young – I'm in a community with coral bleaching what can I do?
  - Bill – exactly this is what we can provide.
  - Dale – we have a chance to move on our own before the state starts there filtering process.
  - Linda- yes we can be step ahead with the one year advance; when the state comes down we can be an example.
  - Dale – we will know what it can be, we'll be prepared
  - Tina – I suspect what they are looking at, they are waiting for the scientific back up, scientific buy in so communities can see that work has been done and it's not just made up.
  - Healani – are all coral species affected or only some?
    - Bill – it varies, there are some areas that have more bleaching then other areas, but yes they are primarily the same species. These events if inevitable due to monster of global change.
    - Dave Dart – are you seeing much recovery?
    - Bill – I am seeing some recovery, some are not as white, some are brown and grey but are algae covered but fish are feeding off of it. All the heavy rains in Maui, was like a large fertilizer falls. This whole bleaching thing is they are being covered by other things.
    - Linda – some are getting their colors back so some are recovering and now we need to determine what is helping other coral reefs to do well and some that have not recovered.

- Short discussion on funding approach
  - o No discussion
- (Added) Discussion to help prepare for December's strategic planning meeting

**Old Business:**

**Announcements:**

- Our next meeting will be the second Thursday, December 10<sup>th</sup>, 2015.

**Adjourn at 8:37pm – Tina Owens – motion to adjourn, second by Chad Wiggins – motion carried and adjourned.**