

## WEST HAWAI'I FISHERY COUNCIL

<http://westhawaiiifisherycouncil.org>

### MISSION STATEMENT OF THE COUNCIL WEST HAWAI'I FISHERY COUNCIL

*"To effectively manage fishery activities to ensure sustainability; enhance nearshore resources; develop and implement management plans for minimizing resource depletion and conflicts of use; per legislative mandate to the Department of Land and Natural Resources to provide for substantive involvement of the community in resource management decisions; and encourage scientific research and monitoring of the nearshore resources and environment from Upolu Point to Ka Lae."*

Thursday, April 20, 2017

West Hawaii Civic Center Liquor Control Conference Room  
(2<sup>nd</sup> Floor of Building B, farthest mauka building)

Chair: Chad Wiggins

Meeting Minutes: Alohi Nakachi

#### **Call to order:** 5:30pm by Chad Wiggins

- Reading and interpretation of WHFC Mission statement by Donna Goodale
- Reiteration by the Chair of the meeting protocols from WHFC policies and operational
- Guidelines and posted at meetings
  - o All questions from Council members must be recognized by the Chair
  - o All questions/statements will be limited to topic-oriented statements.
  - o Note that a short time has been added after each agenda item to discuss each item.
  - o Proxies: Each person asking someone to represent them by proxy will have to notify the administrator before the meeting as to who is going to represent them. There will be no call for proxies from the floor at the meeting.
- Introduction of Visitors
  - o Julia Rose, Damien Chapman (Global Footprint), Katie Flowers, Ross Martin, Kater Hiney Mike Nakachi, Lindsey Cramer, Meagan Iameson, Darren Verbeck, Jan Salerno, Kit Kelly, Bruce Anderson, Juval Howard
- Attendance for members of the council: Chad Wiggins (chair), Donna Goodale, Bill Walsh, (DAR), Dale Sarver, Charlie Young, Bob Hajek,, Alohi Nakachi (Malia Kipapa)
- Approval of Agenda
  - o Dale moves to approve, Charlie seconds,
- Approval of Minutes
  - o Chad: Lou to Lieu from Bruce Andersons edits send
  - o Bob: Typo on first Page Hajek not Hajeck
  - o Dale moves to accept, donna seconds

Presentation by Dr. Damien Chapman and Katie Flowers FIU

- Opening by Damien Chapman
  - Likes to talk to management areas and public when they go to the area. Thanks to DAR to permitting them
  - 100 million sharks killed per year by humans. Large number and unsustainable. Global push to improve shark conservation. The rational besides food conservation but that sharks are a valuable species to the environment. We are only scratching the surface of their ecological role.
  - Study sharks and rays because they are related. Rays are more threatened. Sharks and rays are important tourism resources. Substantial revenue generated, also watching rays particular manta rays here. Total sustainable use
  - They have been studying shark fin trade. Don't have a good trajectory of the species being used. About  $\frac{3}{4}$  species in the trade are coastal species, and they are not well managed on a global scale. We do a better job at managing oceanic species. No catch limits on coastal species
  - Paul G. Allen, who funded them is very concerned and funded them for coastal sharks. Coastal sharks are sharks that live on and around coral reefs as well as Sharks that are more transient species that spend part of their time on the reef
  - I is the lead scientist and there are 7 total in the various regions and I oversea all of them. More than just these 7 we have 50 collaborators, and PhD students and such. These groups are using this info to do real on the ground work
- What they are looking at:
  - What features on the reef, determine the abundance and diversity of sharks on the reef. Same for rays
  - What is the ecological feature for sharks and reefs
  - Where are the key areas that need protection
  - What conservation measures are working and not; and in what context
  - The idea is they will identify key geographies they need to look at and what they need to do there
  - If can better understand the ecological role of reef sharks than can then see what happens when sharks are rays are removed and what this does
- Methods
  - Baited underwater remote video stations (BRUVs)
  - Frame with an arm out front with about 1kg of bait and lowered onto the sea floor, set for 60 minutes and the measure is sharks per hour
  - The small amount of bait only attracts sharks that were already in the area. Encourages any animal in the vicinity to swim into view. They Don't want to feed the animals just want them to swim into view

- Methodology is they define a reef as a few small kilometers, and they use GIS to select a polygon of where they can get to reasonably of a few square kilometers and drop 50-100 BRUVs over a couple weeks in that area
- By the end of 2017, we will survey 450 reefs in more than 50 countries; they are currently half way through the project. They will collect overall 22,500 hours plus of video data
- Very visual and is permanently stored. All data will be open sourced. That is important, because you can use it for more than just the sharks. They have an army of undergraduates combing through this. Phds and post docs go back over to ensure correct identification
- Results
  - Types of reef they are looking at:
    - All data will go in a Bayesian model and will be used to look at the association of sharks and rays with reefs and them with reef fish. That is, to look at their ecological role
    - Reefs they are looking at hot spots for sharks and rays. Looking at what makes them a hot spot. A few of these include the Bahamas, Indian Ocean territory of Australia, New Caledonia, northern reaches of the great barrier reefs. One thing they tend to find in hot spots is marine reserves and then the other areas are remote so there is low fishing pressures
    - Other areas they are looking at are refuges for certain species. These include hammerheads and wedge fish because they have very large fins. Want to look at them to protect them because they may be some of the last left
    - Last kind of reef, he thinks is most important, is bright spots where you have a lot of fishing and very few management efforts. They find that there are still a moderate amount of sharks and rays despite this, so there must be something that is working and they want to find out why it is working and if you can use what is working elsewhere. Do not have such a good feel for these yet. Some areas that have stuck out is Trinidad and Tobago which is one of the largest shark finning areas of the Caribbean; Turks and Caicos there are no regulations for the sharks yet they are very abundant there; Belize has a lot of sharks, and Fiji as well. They are in early stages of identifying these areas and why they are working
- Where does Kona fit in?
  - Have set 100 BRUVs here and looked at 88 (speed watched) but will go through thoroughly later
  - Local knowledge point this as a potential refuge for mantas and hammerheads
  - Chose an area that was protected (Kealakekua bay) and then Honokohau harbor as an area with more of a fishing impact
- Kealakekua bay

- Initial points were changed to avoid people. They were chosen as random as possible but to avoid ocean users as well
- Depth of BRUVs were between 2-40 meters
- Species seen: Mantas, white tip reef sharks, tiger shark (had hook and liter wire trailing from it), scalloped hammerhead
- Some BRUVs are stereo BRUVs with lasers to determine size of animals
- Have a lot of reef fish around the bait so may miss sharks in the distance or may be difficult to identify
- (do you quantify the reef fish in the videos? asked by Bill Walsh) yes, not sure with Hawaii yet who will be the scientist for that
- Honokohau harbor
  - Species seen: Spotted eagle ray, white tip reef shark, several tiger sharks (minimum 2 individuals and maximum 4 individuals)
  - Bait cage is 1 meter long and 60cm high
  - There are also a lot of carcasses in that harbor
  - Will be examining reef fish data, giant trevally, dolphins, herbivorous fish, moray eels, green sea turtles, had divers to go near their BRUVs- does not interfere actually helps to see if divers affect what is happening with the sharks
- Closing
  - Had an amazing time, will produce a lot of data that can use
  - Have several social media channels
    - Globalfinprint.org
    - Vimeo.com/globalfinprint
    - Twitter.com/globalfinprint
    - Facebook.com/globalfinproject
- Questions/answers
  - Kater Hiney: When you talk about fishing and hot spots is it coastal or global?
    - Damien: Mostly focus on coastal. For the residential reef species would look at coastal
    - Kater: Isn't open seas where shark finning happening?
    - Damien: Well it does but there is a heck of a lot happening coastal because they are landing the sharks and eating the meat as well. In the past, a big issue has been finning. It is wasteful but whether it is sustainable or not is the key
  - Mike Nakachi: When you place the BRUV down how do you do it?
    - Damien: If it is clear will you place it down with a snorkeler or if not we will lower it down slowly
    - Mike: Does permit take into account cultural context?
    - Damien: Have to ask DAR
    - Mike: How were sites chosen also with cultural context?
    - Damien: One is protected area and one is a fishing area

- Mike: Is there any footage of the baited trap being destroyed? No, no footage of sharks picking it up and thrashing it. One BRUV was picked up and destroyed by a boat driving over it really fast in a no wake zone too
- Kit Kelly: In regards to the permitting process did you reach out to the state of Hawaii or did they reach out to them? Also Is this NOAA and if its not why is it not NOAA, and how does this get permitted? You bait this area but then you take the bait out of there but the scent is still there and the current takes them and it is a small amount but overall it creates a lot and covers a wide area? How is this not reckless behavior as this creates scent and brings predators near the shore where people are swimming?
  - Chad: I am just going to interject say permitting is not their kuleana
  - Damien: one BRUV is 1 kg of bait and there is maybe 6 bruvs at once. These are not bringing in sharks from a large area it is just attracting sharks already in that area and that I can say that with confidence. There was only one shark that we saw that actually saw turn towards it. There are 1 kg which makes 100 kg total over 10 days which sounds like a lot but is not really and is less that fishing vessel would put into the water. With input from local knowledge, they did their best to avoid areas and times that were heavy swimming areas and such.
- Bob Hajek: Any plans down the road to revisit these sites and see a trend?
  - Damien: Yeah a lot of these areas they want to see a time series data for.

#### Discussion Items:

- Funding extensions from the county council donors
  - Charlie: I have not heard from Karen, but again all we have to do is apply for the extension. I think we just apply at the office
  - Dale: from what we heard last time the people who are funding us have to make the approach not us
  - Chad: is there a next step?
    - Charlie: just follow up again
    - Dale: Maile's has spent as far as he knows
  - Charlie: So we should only go to Daren?
  - Dale: Wasn't there three?
  - Chad: Margret Willie was the one that can be extended
  - Dale: Then to approach Margret Willie and Karen Eoff
  - Charlie: I will contact Karen. Are we going to extend the entire amount or just a portion
  - Dale: I think it is just the amount of money we want to extend
- Budget for spending County Council funds, both short and long term assumptions

- Chad: At a meeting 3 months ago, we decided an amount to spend of Margret Willie's. It seems there are another 7,000. Are there needs for that we want accounted for?
  - Donna: Next meeting is in May, which is before the deadline in June. I spent about \$190
  - Dale: we were talking about publications
  - Chad: Yes, we have a quote. We need to make sure we have everything for our outstation meeting that will come out of Margret Willie's and that is our priority. Do we need to see if we need an extension?
  - Dale: If we need to talk about an extension, if we do not have a list to spend it on you are just going to be spinning your wheels. They are going to want to know exactly what you are spending it on so we need a rough budget. We only have a rough budget for the first 3k not for the rest
  - Charlie: if I look at the budget that we came up with that brought us up to 7,300 that I used to ask for the funding that came to the number. So part of it was to pay for admin costs and doing minutes, maintaining the records, but we were going to renew our domain, it that still a cost we are going to consider. So those are costs we can highlight as well as the one offs we will have. So should I go by that budget originally? Because that is half of the 7,300 I can use and that as it is the budget I used to asked Maile and Karen for funding. So I can use that as a basis. So we are going to need an extension for at least ½ of the 7300
  - Chad: Can we request a 12 months extension
  - Donna: I think I heard the month of December
  - Charlie: I think it is good for a year after the funding is given to you
  - Dale: I think it would be a year. There was I thinks some of the publications would cost a significant amount of money since we were going to make a few of them

(Jumped around and touched on brochure and Panel Design)

- Chad: I got a quote of \$2,800 but would include an activity that we would all have to participate in to help choose a look for the council. But he can follow up with her but it is pretty extensive
  - Charlie: if it is something that is going to be used with in the future, it can be updated and used as our trademark I think the initial investment is worth it. We need more visuals and we need more handouts. Especially with the outstation meetings, our PowerPoint was good but we had to borrow the projector. However, I think the spending for those visuals and handouts is worth it. So the \$2800 only counts for the artwork, not the printing right

- Chad: yeah but the printing would be on top of it. It is somewhere in the range of \$500 for 200 brochures
- Making a Google doc for the brochure was talked about
- Chad: I think what we did for the power point was very good can we do that for the brochure as well? Had a working group for the power point
- Donna: we had a power point for the group and I got it off the cloud and may have edited a couple slides, did just a little tweaking on the slides. I am not in town for the next meeting so someone will have to make sure they have a copy of the PowerPoint
- Chad: not talking about changing it, just the process that made it
- Donna: I think MAlia did like 90% of it and I just tweaked a little bit of it. So someone needs that for the next meeting, needs it on a computer and a projector for it
- Chad: I know there is a screen there but I can get a projector there. Just send me the link and I can have it on the computer. It is at Kualoa church at Puako. Are we passing or do we want to move forward with the graphic designer at \$2,800
- Dale: I don't think we need it
- Donna: I agree with Charlie it is a good investment maybe we can look at another graphic designer
- Charlie: is it based off Alohi's design?
- Chad: I sent her the brochures that we have it would just be to make it more attractive to the public

(Began talking about a video project we discussed in earlier meetings but not on the agenda)

- Dale: I do not know how far we took it but didn't we discuss a contest for some students to create a video? That would be a way to get students involved.
  - Donna: that is as far as we took it
  - Dale: there would be an educational aspect to that and it would be attractive to the funders who really want to see the kids involved
  - Donna: every school has a video program
  - Dale: do you know any schools that have those that may be interested
  - Donna: I know Kealakehe does, I think Pālamanui has something
  - Charlie: I contacted the Hiki Nō program at Konawaena where my daughter works and they are interested but it did not go any further than that
  - Dale: It would be good to get interest from many different groups

- Charlie: I assume it the process would be interviews of members and would be history of the group and the legislation and it would be a very interesting story. A lot of the people that testified in the beginning, there were a lot of young people. I can work on that as a format. I do not know how they get funded
- Dale: We have funding so we can supply
- Charlie: on another note, we are having a fishing tournament down at Ho'okena and we can set up a booth for the WHFC and bring some brochures and set aside half an hour and talk to the kids. It is pole fishing, and teaching the kids, you do not kill it unless you eat it. It will be some time in July. We also have an ono tournament that is on May 27<sup>th</sup>. But those kind things of I think help to promote WHFC notoriety. Therefore, we could set up a tent at the fishing tournament.
- Chad: have you volunteered to check up the Hiki Nō video
- Charlie: yes
- Palamanui Earth Day activities and Display Board Update (Donna Goodale)
  - Chad: speaking of the booth I think it is important to identify areas the WHFC can be apart of. Next item is you are going to be at Palamanui for Earth Day?
    - Donna: yes. There are going to be different speakers talking this Saturday. So they are trying to get people to come to the campus as well as to appreciate that it is earth day. I have the display board put together; I am going to have a table somewhere. Another thing we were talking about purchasing was a little pop up tent for events like Charlie's fishing tournament so we are not standing in the hot sun. So the display board is up, I took most of the things off what was on the power point.
    - Chad: should we take a look
    - Donna: sure
    - Dale: I think it is a good presentation. So how do you think it is going to go there
    - Donna: it starts at 9am and goes to 1. I do not when the speakers are going to go. I do not have any brochures but if I had some, I would hand them out. The only one I have is from Lindsey Kramer.
    - Kate Hiney: what about DAR handouts
    - Donna: yeah that would work
    - Chad: do you want to print out brochures as they exist or membership applications
    - Donna: membership applications is a good idea
    - Kate: another good idea is to have a sign in sheet for people that want more information



- Chad: also to add the Facebook page to the board or somewhere
- DLNR reef management plan update
  - Bruce: We have a bunch of samples of oxybenzone free sunscreen if you want to hand them out
    - Charlie: we will hand them out at the keiki fishing tournament because if you don't replace them they are just going to keep using what they have
  - Bruce: I will be up here on Saturday at the KCC to talk about the coral bleaching plan. I will be giving a short presentation
  - Dr. Bruce DLNR Update
    - Quick update at the legislature, in the last stages, there are only a few. House bill 450 proposing an appropriation of the effects of sunscreen on Hawaiian corals. Good bill we are supporting. There has only been one study and that was just a lab study
    - Bill 588 to support Heeia National Estuarine Research Reserve was proposed multiple places. It was proposed to establish the first one in Hawaii at Heeia Bay. Looking with some of our funding to redirect the stream to reduce some of the stressors on the reef from run off and algae control meetings
    - Senate bill 110: the in lieu fee program. Collect money for developers and the state that are displacing corals. In addition, we can use that money to do other helpful things for the reef. We are talking millions of dollars. It is enough money to do substantial works.
    - Finally, senate bill 1240 that has to do with AQ fishing. DLNR would be required to submit to 2019 session defining what sustainable means and create limits on all reef fish. We just cannot do that for all reef fish by 2019 it is impossible. It is not even feasible for aquarium species. I think there are a couple hundred of species taken at some time by AQ fishers. I do not know if that Bill is going to go anywhere, I hope not. It has gone further this year than it has ever before, further than I thought it would go for sure. This bill concerns him. This would restrict us to permit aquarium fishing. Technically it would just stop DLNR issuing small mesh nets not stop aquarium fishing. They can still go out and collect fish. I am not sure they actually know what we do with the permitting process. It does allowing existing permittees to go out but no new permits to be issues. Perhaps that is why it is gone so far. It is troubling to us because it is sustainable to us. I do not think it is an effective measure
    - There are also several resolutions that are still in effect. One is that which is dealing with Hawaiian culture
    - You can still comment and talk to your legislators but they do not formally take testimony. Lots of bad bills died. The in lie fee

process is still alive which is good for us. Hopeful we will get through this without any major problems in the next couple weeks

- Chad: we also have the reef management plan on the agenda
  - Bruce: the plan is available to everyone on the website; we moved it kind of hidden on the side to up front. We are hoping we can use it to help with some of the management plans in the future. There is a whole series of things the report promotes. We have talking about promoting statewide rules that limits the take of herbivorous fish. In my mind that is something, we can do very easily and would be very effective especially with bleaching concerns. We also have a number of watershed management plans. We are moving towards a comprehensive geological management plans where we have new limits and restrictions that would optimize the areas. We have a new planner working on that. I hope that one of those days we will be able to bring them over here and talk to us about that. We also have a new coral reef coordinator we are hiring, we have about 12 candidates up for that. We have some real good opportunities to do more planning. That is the hole DLNR had when I first started is they did not have room for a lot of planning. We have good legal support now. In next few months, there will be a lot more activity. Molokai is planning a north shore subsistence fishing area. Imposing new rules on Molokai. Also new rules that are more regionally broad
- Next outstation meeting in Puakō, May 18<sup>th</sup>, 2017
  - Chad: We will be in Puako next month at Hokuloa church next month. We will want to get food. Anyone willing to lead on that, we have the budget for it just need someone to pick it up?
    - Julie: I can do it just need to know how to get reimbursed
  - Chad: do we want to print out some of the brochures as well
    - Alohi: I will or check with Malia to get a google doc out with the brochure in the next couple of days and then get some edits over the next couple of weeks
  - Dale: should we buy a projector?
    - Chad: we should, they start at \$500 but where would it live
    - Dale: It could live at my house I do not care
  - Donna: do we want the display board?
    - Chad: yeah, anything else for next month?
  - Dale: do we have any idea of the concerns they have and want us to solve?
    - Donna: if you show them the flow chart they are going to realize it is not going to get solved tomorrow
    - Bruce: I just came from the wastewater meeting down stairs and there is a lot of concern of the Puako and Wailea wastewater and how it is affecting the reef and we are going to

- get concern about that. There is a lot of interest at getting better and more efficient management in that
    - Chad: it is very likely we will hear about the wastewater and reports of night time fishing and maybe the same issues that were felt at Kawaihae
  - Charlie: will there be a chair?
    - Dale: I can chair it
    - Chad: I will chair if you Charlie give the presentation
    - Charlie: how can I refuse that
    - Chad: is it ok if we meet up at 5 and get set up and have our rules
    - Group: mumbled mmmm
  - Chad: I do not think it is likely but it is possible that people can get pretty vocal that they do not want to see any new fishing rules so be prepared if it does. Also, a group in mahu kona and south kona may be interested in hosting an outstation meeting. This brings me back and we do not have a decision on the brochures
- (Jumped back to brochure and panel design)
  - Charlie: I would like to propose that we send the money or at least have a special meeting before the next one, a subcommittee in a couple weeks to meet with the person. The meeting is really to decide if we want to have a graphic designer
    - Chad: we could ask to have the design by may 18 but we need to make that decision. I will email out the quote and we can meet in person to go over the existing brochure and do any edits.
    - Decided to meet May 3, 10 am at Waimea TNC conference room (confirmed: Chad, Charlie, Donna, Alohi)
- (Began talking about new mission statement, not on agenda but was talked about at previous meetings)
  - Dale: David Tarnas made some comments on the draft for the new mission statement. He recommended that we actually put a reference to the bill wording in there at the very end. I added that and sent that to Malia and she was going to send. It has not changed a lot
- Ka'upulehu Review/Update
  - Chad: KMLAc review/update is on the agenda. People are starting to see changes in the fish behavior there. They are starting to approach people there. There is suspicion the opihi are starting to come back. There are major concerns with whether people will violate the rules and there is a makai watch there. To my knowledge there is no egregious violations and most are people coming in and the guards will stop people with gear and just education to people
  - Mike: the fish behavior with the rugosity chain the fish were really curious. The only people you see with a dive flag are those at Hualalai that are transient diving on the scooters. But to my knowledge there is no violations with people with three prongs

- Chad: the UH law school has actually been there for two semesters now looking at the legality of it with concerns to Hawaiian culture. It will be interesting to see the states data because they have a survey site there to see if there are any changes. In 5 years the community will be re-approaching the council with a harvest plan for a sustainable harvest plan after the 10 year rest. Would like us to think about how protected areas fit into West Hawaii because we do have a network for FRAs. Are there any other announcements or shall we adjourn
- Next meeting items and Discussion:
  - Outstation meeting at Hokuloa
  - Meeting at 5pm to get set up and make sure everyone is on the same page
  - Chad will chair the meeting
  - Charlie will give the presentation on the background of the WHFC
  - There will be a subcommittee meeting on May3, at 10am in Waimea at TNC conference room to determine the finalization of the brochure and meet with potential graphic designer
    - Discuss whether to print out brochures for outstation meeting

**Adjourn at 7:23pm:** Donna makes a motion to adjourn, Dale Sarver 2<sup>nd</sup> motion meeting adjourn